

**From:** [Turner, Andrew](#)  
**To:** [Skipwith, Aurelia](#); [Budd-Falen, Karen J](#); [Romanik, Peg A](#)  
**Cc:** [cspilker@collierenterprises.com](mailto:cspilker@collierenterprises.com); [Clements, E. Carter Chandler](#)  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Meeting to Discuss HCP Project  
**Date:** Wednesday, February 12, 2020 6:04:37 PM  
**Importance:** High

---

Dear Director Skipwith, Deputy Solicitor Budd-Falen, and Associate Solicitor Romanik, On behalf of the Eastern Collier Property Owners (ECPO), I am writing to request an opportunity to discuss an issue that has delayed the review and processing of ECPO's Habitat Conservation Plan (HCP), which covers 151,442 acres of private property in Southwest Florida, and ECPO's associated incidental take permit (ITP) applications. The issue concerns whether future, offsite collisions between Florida panthers and vehicles operated by third parties on state, county and local roadways should be attributed to the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service's issuance of the proposed ITPs. The answer, in our view, is no.

The HCP is a unique effort to achieve landscape scale conservation goals within a large area of private land owned by twelve separate companies in Southwest Florida. The HCP is the result of a collaborative effort by the landowners and four leading conservation organizations, including Defenders of Wildlife, Florida Wildlife Federation, Audubon Florida and Audubon of the Western Everglades. The HCP is a landscape-level plan that would permanently preserve 106,442 acres of privately owned land that could otherwise be developed, to provide valuable habitat for the Florida panther and eighteen other protected species. The HCP would cap future development at 45,000 acres and cluster and direct that development to areas with lower habitat values (many of which are in active, large-scale agricultural use), and would preserve valuable regional wildlife corridors that facilitate wildlife movement between existing, publicly owned conservation lands in Southwest Florida. As an additional benefit, the HCP would establish funding mechanisms based on (i) contributions as lands are developed and (ii) fees generated as homes within the HCP Area are sold, which are projected to accrue up to \$150 million over the life of the HCP. A small portion of the funds will be used for HCP implementation, and the remainder will be available to fund other conservation activities to benefit species covered by the HCP.

The Service's issuance of the proposed ITPs is the federal agency action at issue. The ITPs would authorize take that occurs incidental to development and earth mining by ECPO members on their privately owned lands within the HCP area. The take would be in the form of harassment for the panther and most other covered species (e.g., disturbance caused by construction or mining activities), and potential harm for a few primarily ground burrowing species. The ITPs would not authorize the development or mining activities themselves. Moreover, the only roads on which collisions between panthers and vehicles are likely to occur are public roads not controlled by the applicants or covered by the HCP where vehicles travel at higher speeds. The ITPs would not apply to or govern the design or operation of those roadways, or third party vehicle operations on those roadways. Issuance of the ITPs will not determine or control whether, when or where any future panther vehicle collisions may occur. Accordingly, the Service's issuance of the ITPs is not the cause of any projected future vehicle collisions with panthers, nor are the relevant circumstances of any such future collisions reasonably certain. For this reason, future offsite third party vehicle collisions with panthers should not be deemed "effects of the action" under 50 C.F.R. 402.02.

The ECPO members have, since the time their ITP applications were first submitted in June 2010 (and resubmitted in August and September 2018), consistently taken the position that issuance of the ITPs will not be the cause of future offsite third party vehicle collisions with panthers.

Nonetheless, while such collisions should not be deemed “effects of the action” under 50 C.F.R. 402.02, the ECPO members have urged the Service to carefully analyze panther-vehicle collisions in baseline and cumulative effects analyses, and have provided substantial analytical information and technical data to support such analyses. Additionally, the ECPO members have committed to direct at least fifty percent of the first \$25 million of funding generated by HCP implementation toward the construction of wildlife crossings and associated fencing on public roadways in order to reduce vehicle collisions with panthers and other species, as sought by the Service and other stakeholders. The HCP process (including the Department’s review timeline) is stalled, and has been paused since August 2019 to address this issue. Accordingly, we request and look forward to an opportunity to discuss this issue with you.

Best Regards,

Andrew J. Turner

Partner

Hunton Andrews Kurth LLP

2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20037

202.955.1658

**From:** [Dove, William T](#)  
**To:** [Turner, Andrew](#); [Budd-Falen, Karen J](#); [Romanik, Peg A](#)  
**Cc:** [cspilker@collierenterprises.com](mailto:cspilker@collierenterprises.com); [Clements, E. Carter Chandler](#); [Skipwith, Aurelia](#)  
**Subject:** RE: Meeting to Discuss HCP Project  
**Date:** Tuesday, February 18, 2020 5:15:51 PM  
**Importance:** High

---

Hi Andrew,

Apologies for the delay. I would be happy to meet with your group to discuss this issue further. I will be out of the office the remainder of this week. Would it work to set up a time first thing next week, either Monday or early Tuesday? I would like to have Karen and Peg join as well for background and their perspectives.

Let me know if there is a time that works and we can work to set something up. I look forward to hearing from you.

Best,

Billy

**Billy Dove**

*Senior Advisor*

Office of the Director, U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service

U.S. Department of the Interior

Cell: 571-369-1313

*NOTE: Every email I send or receive is subject to release under the Freedom of Information Act.*

---

**From:** Skipwith, Aurelia X <[aurelia\\_x\\_skipwith@fws.gov](mailto:aurelia_x_skipwith@fws.gov)>

**Sent:** Thursday, February 13, 2020 6:29 AM

**To:** Turner, Andrew <[aturner@hunton.com](mailto:aturner@hunton.com)>; Budd-Falen, Karen J <[karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov](mailto:karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov)>; Romanik, Peg A <[PEG.ROMANIK@sol.doi.gov](mailto:PEG.ROMANIK@sol.doi.gov)>; Dove, William T <[william\\_dove@ios.doi.gov](mailto:william_dove@ios.doi.gov)>

**Cc:** [cspilker@collierenterprises.com](mailto:cspilker@collierenterprises.com); Clements, E. Carter Chandler <[eclements@hunton.com](mailto:eclements@hunton.com)>

**Subject:** RE: Meeting to Discuss HCP Project

Good morning Andrew,

Thank you for message and will look into this matter of the delay of the ITP being issued. Billy Dove, who I've included here, will be your point of contact. He will reach out to so that we can reach a resolution. Thank you.

---

**From:** Turner, Andrew <[aturner@hunton.com](mailto:aturner@hunton.com)>

**Sent:** Wednesday, February 12, 2020 6:05 PM

**To:** Skipwith, Aurelia X <[aurelia\\_x\\_skipwith@fws.gov](mailto:aurelia_x_skipwith@fws.gov)>; Budd-Falen, Karen J <[karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov](mailto:karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov)>; Romanik, Peg A <[PEG.ROMANIK@sol.doi.gov](mailto:PEG.ROMANIK@sol.doi.gov)>

**Cc:** [cspilker@collierenterprises.com](mailto:cspilker@collierenterprises.com); Clements, E. Carter Chandler <[eclements@hunton.com](mailto:eclements@hunton.com)>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Meeting to Discuss HCP Project

Dear Director Skipwith, Deputy Solicitor Budd-Falen, and Associate Solicitor Romanik,

On behalf of the Eastern Collier Property Owners (ECPO), I am writing to request an opportunity to discuss an issue that has delayed the review and processing of ECPO's Habitat Conservation Plan (HCP), which covers 151,442 acres of private property in Southwest Florida, and ECPO's associated incidental take permit (ITP) applications. The issue concerns whether future, offsite collisions between Florida panthers and vehicles operated by third parties on state, county and local roadways should be attributed to the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service's issuance of the proposed ITPs. The answer, in our view, is no.

The HCP is a unique effort to achieve landscape scale conservation goals within a large area of private land owned by twelve separate companies in Southwest Florida. The HCP is the result of a collaborative effort by the landowners and four leading conservation organizations, including Defenders of Wildlife, Florida Wildlife Federation, Audubon Florida and Audubon of the Western Everglades. The HCP is a landscape-level plan that would permanently preserve 106,442 acres of privately owned land that could otherwise be developed, to provide valuable habitat for the Florida panther and eighteen other protected species. The HCP would cap future development at 45,000 acres and cluster and direct that development to areas with lower habitat values (many of which are in active, large-scale agricultural use), and would preserve valuable regional wildlife corridors that facilitate wildlife movement between existing, publicly owned conservation lands in Southwest Florida. As an additional benefit, the HCP would establish funding mechanisms based on (i) contributions as lands are developed and (ii) fees generated as homes within the HCP Area are sold, which are projected to accrue up to \$150 million over the life of the HCP. A small portion of the funds will be used for HCP implementation, and the remainder will be available to fund other conservation activities to benefit species covered by the HCP.

The Service's issuance of the proposed ITPs is the federal agency action at issue. The ITPs would authorize take that occurs incidental to development and earth mining by ECPO members on their privately owned lands within the HCP area. The take would be in the form of harassment for the panther and most other covered species (e.g., disturbance caused by construction or mining activities), and potential harm for a few primarily ground burrowing species. The ITPs would not authorize the development or mining activities themselves. Moreover, the only roads on which collisions between panthers and vehicles are likely to occur are public roads not controlled by the applicants or covered by the HCP where vehicles travel at higher speeds. The ITPs would not apply to or govern the design or operation of those roadways, or third party vehicle operations on those roadways. Issuance of the ITPs will not determine or control whether, when or where any future panther vehicle collisions may occur. Accordingly, the Service's issuance of the ITPs is not the cause of any projected future vehicle collisions with panthers, nor are the relevant circumstances of any such future collisions reasonably certain. For this reason, future offsite third party vehicle collisions with panthers should not be deemed "effects of the action" under 50 C.F.R. 402.02.

The ECPO members have, since the time their ITP applications were first submitted in June 2010 (and resubmitted in August and September 2018), consistently taken the position that issuance of the ITPs will not be the cause of future offsite third party vehicle collisions with panthers.

Nonetheless, while such collisions should not be deemed "effects of the action" under 50 C.F.R. 402.02, the ECPO members have urged the Service to carefully analyze panther-vehicle collisions in baseline and cumulative effects analyses, and have provided substantial analytical information and technical data to support such analyses. Additionally, the ECPO members have committed to direct at least fifty percent of the first \$25 million of funding generated by HCP implementation toward the construction of wildlife crossings and associated fencing on public roadways in order to reduce vehicle collisions with panthers and other species, as sought by the Service and other stakeholders. The HCP process (including the Department's review timeline) is stalled, and has been paused since August 2019 to address this issue. Accordingly, we request and look forward to an opportunity to discuss this issue with you.

Best Regards,  
Andrew J. Turner  
Partner

Hunton Andrews Kurth LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20037  
202.955.1658

**From:** [Dove, William](#)  
**To:** [Budd-Falen, Karen J](#); [Romanik, Peg A](#)  
**Subject:** FW: Meeting to Discuss HCP Project  
**Date:** Monday, February 24, 2020 2:19:42 PM  
**Importance:** High

---

Karen & Peg,

Wanted to touch base with you two on your availability to meet with these folks this week. Peg, I remember you had said that you might be out of town after Tuesday, I could work with them to schedule it when one or both of you could join me in this meeting.

I will defer to the two of you on what you suggest before I set this up.

Best,

Billy

---

**From:** Turner, Andrew <[aturner@hunton.com](mailto:aturner@hunton.com)>  
**Sent:** Thursday, February 20, 2020 12:23 PM  
**To:** Dove, William T <[william\\_dove@ios.doi.gov](mailto:william_dove@ios.doi.gov)>  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] RE: Meeting to Discuss HCP Project

Billy,

I have conferred with my client Tom Jones, Vice President for Government Affairs at the Barron Collier Companies. Tom is available Wednesday and Thursday of next week if either of those days would work for you, Karen and Peg. If not, please let me know what other dates would work. Thank you,

Andrew

---

**From:** Turner, Andrew  
**Sent:** Wednesday, February 19, 2020 1:26 PM  
**To:** Dove, William T <[william\\_dove@ios.doi.gov](mailto:william_dove@ios.doi.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Meeting to Discuss HCP Project

Billy,

Thank you for your email. I am checking with my client on his availability for a meeting next week, and will be back in touch with you by tomorrow morning. My initial sense is that early Tuesday would work, or perhaps Wednesday or Thursday as alternatives (understanding those days may not work for you, Karen or Peg). I will be back in touch as soon as I know more.

Best Regards,

Andrew

---

**From:** Dove, William T <[william\\_dove@ios.doi.gov](mailto:william_dove@ios.doi.gov)>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, February 18, 2020 5:16 PM  
**To:** Turner, Andrew <[aturner@hunton.com](mailto:aturner@hunton.com)>; Budd-Falen, Karen J <[karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov](mailto:karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov)>; Romanik, Peg A <[PEG.ROMANIK@sol.doi.gov](mailto:PEG.ROMANIK@sol.doi.gov)>  
**Cc:** [cspilker@collierenterprises.com](mailto:cspilker@collierenterprises.com); Clements, E. Carter Chandler <[eclements@hunton.com](mailto:eclements@hunton.com)>; Skipwith, Aurelia X <[aurelia\\_x\\_skipwith@fws.gov](mailto:aurelia_x_skipwith@fws.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Meeting to Discuss HCP Project

Hi Andrew,

Apologies for the delay. I would be happy to meet with your group to discuss this issue further. I will be out of the office the remainder of this week. Would it work to set up a time first thing next week, either Monday or early Tuesday? I would like to have Karen and Peg join as well for background and their perspectives.

Let me know if there is a time that works and we can work to set something up. I look forward to hearing from you.

Best,

Billy

**Billy Dove**

*Senior Advisor*

Office of the Director, U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service

U.S. Department of the Interior

Cell: 571-369-1313

*NOTE: Every email I send or receive is subject to release under the Freedom of Information Act.*

---

**From:** Skipwith, Aurelia X <[aurelia\\_x\\_skipwith@fws.gov](mailto:aurelia_x_skipwith@fws.gov)>  
**Sent:** Thursday, February 13, 2020 6:29 AM  
**To:** Turner, Andrew <[aturner@hunton.com](mailto:aturner@hunton.com)>; Budd-Falen, Karen J <[karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov](mailto:karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov)>; Romanik, Peg A <[PEG.ROMANIK@sol.doi.gov](mailto:PEG.ROMANIK@sol.doi.gov)>; Dove, William T <[william\\_dove@ios.doi.gov](mailto:william_dove@ios.doi.gov)>  
**Cc:** [cspilker@collierenterprises.com](mailto:cspilker@collierenterprises.com); Clements, E. Carter Chandler <[eclements@hunton.com](mailto:eclements@hunton.com)>  
**Subject:** RE: Meeting to Discuss HCP Project

Good morning Andrew,

Thank you for message and will look into this matter of the delay of the ITP being issued. Billy Dove, who I've included here, will be your point of contact. He will reach out to so that we can reach

a resolution. Thank you.

---

**From:** Turner, Andrew <[aturner@hunton.com](mailto:aturner@hunton.com)>

**Sent:** Wednesday, February 12, 2020 6:05 PM

**To:** Skipwith, Aurelia X <[aurelia\\_x\\_skipwith@fws.gov](mailto:aurelia_x_skipwith@fws.gov)>; Budd-Falen, Karen J <[karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov](mailto:karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov)>; Romanik, Peg A <[PEG.ROMANIK@sol.doi.gov](mailto:PEG.ROMANIK@sol.doi.gov)>

**Cc:** [cspilker@collierenterprises.com](mailto:cspilker@collierenterprises.com); Clements, E. Carter Chandler <[eclements@hunton.com](mailto:eclements@hunton.com)>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Meeting to Discuss HCP Project

Dear Director Skipwith, Deputy Solicitor Budd-Falen, and Associate Solicitor Romanik,

On behalf of the Eastern Collier Property Owners (ECPO), I am writing to request an opportunity to discuss an issue that has delayed the review and processing of ECPO's Habitat Conservation Plan (HCP), which covers 151,442 acres of private property in Southwest Florida, and ECPO's associated incidental take permit (ITP) applications. The issue concerns whether future, offsite collisions between Florida panthers and vehicles operated by third parties on state, county and local roadways should be attributed to the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service's issuance of the proposed ITPs. The answer, in our view, is no.

The HCP is a unique effort to achieve landscape scale conservation goals within a large area of private land owned by twelve separate companies in Southwest Florida. The HCP is the result of a collaborative effort by the landowners and four leading conservation organizations, including Defenders of Wildlife, Florida Wildlife Federation, Audubon Florida and Audubon of the Western Everglades. The HCP is a landscape-level plan that would permanently preserve 106,442 acres of privately owned land that could otherwise be developed, to provide valuable habitat for the Florida panther and eighteen other protected species. The HCP would cap future development at 45,000 acres and cluster and direct that development to areas with lower habitat values (many of which are in active, large-scale agricultural use), and would preserve valuable regional wildlife corridors that facilitate wildlife movement between existing, publicly owned conservation lands in Southwest Florida. As an additional benefit, the HCP would establish funding mechanisms based on (i) contributions as lands are developed and (ii) fees generated as homes within the HCP Area are sold, which are projected to accrue up to \$150 million over the life of the HCP. A small portion of the funds will be used for HCP implementation, and the remainder will be available to fund other conservation activities to benefit species covered by the HCP.

The Service's issuance of the proposed ITPs is the federal agency action at issue. The ITPs would authorize take that occurs incidental to development and earth mining by ECPO members on their privately owned lands within the HCP area. The take would be in the form of harassment for the panther and most other covered species (e.g., disturbance caused by construction or mining activities), and potential harm for a few primarily ground burrowing species. The ITPs would not authorize the development or mining activities themselves. Moreover, the only roads on which collisions between panthers and vehicles are likely to occur are public roads not controlled by the applicants or covered by the HCP where vehicles travel at higher speeds. The ITPs would not apply to or govern the design or operation of those roadways, or third party vehicle operations on those roadways. Issuance of the ITPs will not determine or control whether, when or where any future

panther vehicle collisions may occur. Accordingly, the Service's issuance of the ITPs is not the cause of any projected future vehicle collisions with panthers, nor are the relevant circumstances of any such future collisions reasonably certain. For this reason, future offsite third party vehicle collisions with panthers should not be deemed "effects of the action" under 50 C.F.R. 402.02.

The ECPO members have, since the time their ITP applications were first submitted in June 2010 (and resubmitted in August and September 2018), consistently taken the position that issuance of the ITPs will not be the cause of future offsite third party vehicle collisions with panthers. Nonetheless, while such collisions should not be deemed "effects of the action" under 50 C.F.R. 402.02, the ECPO members have urged the Service to carefully analyze panther-vehicle collisions in baseline and cumulative effects analyses, and have provided substantial analytical information and technical data to support such analyses. Additionally, the ECPO members have committed to direct at least fifty percent of the first \$25 million of funding generated by HCP implementation toward the construction of wildlife crossings and associated fencing on public roadways in order to reduce vehicle collisions with panthers and other species, as sought by the Service and other stakeholders.

The HCP process (including the Department's review timeline) is stalled, and has been paused since August 2019 to address this issue. Accordingly, we request and look forward to an opportunity to discuss this issue with you.

Best Regards,

Andrew J. Turner  
Partner  
Hunton Andrews Kurth LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20037  
202.955.1658

**From:** [Franklin, Micquetta V](#)  
**To:** [Romanik, Peg A](#); [Budd-Falen, Karen J](#)  
**Subject:** New FOIA Request SOL-2020-00147  
**Date:** Monday, June 15, 2020 10:28:41 AM  
**Attachments:** [FOIA Request SOL-2020-00147 \(Tobias\).pdf](#)  
[FOIA Control Form \(10.8.19\).pdf](#)

---

Good morning All,

The SOL FOIA Office received a request on, May 6, 2020 (attached) in which the requester, Mr. Jimmy Tobias seeks

“Any emails, email attachments, or other documents related to the Solicitor's review of the white paper referenced in the email chain attached below to this request. This request specifically seeks a copy of the Solicitor office's review of the white paper in question, which is entitled "The Proper Scope of Environmental Analysis of Roadway Impacts" and was written in February 2017 by lawyers for the East Collier Property Owners. This request seeks a copy of any communications between the Solicitor's office and/or the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service and the East Collier Property Owners and their lawyers at the firm Hunton & Williams/Hunton AK concerning this white paper or SOL's review of said white paper.”

Please provide your response to this email, affirming or denying whether you believe you will have responsive information within one business day of receipt. Additionally, **please provide the date when you started your search for responsive documents.**

**Please let me know if you have any concerns about the scope as soon as possible.**

**Please let me know if you think anybody else should receive this request that isn't cc'd on the email.**

**Attached is a Control Form please send the form back completed with your responsive documents**

Please provide any responsive documents by **Monday, June 22nd**

Thank you.

**MicQuetta Franklin**  
Litigation Support II  
Division of Administration  
Office of the Solicitor  
U.S. Department of the Interior  
1849 C St., NW MS 6071  
Washington, DC 20240  
Office (202) 219-3493

**From:** [Webforms, DOI](#)  
**To:** [Foia, SOL](#)  
**Subject:** FOIA from: Jimmy Tobias  
**Date:** Wednesday, May 6, 2020 2:48:44 PM

---

Submitted on Wednesday, May 6, 2020 - 2:50pm

Submitted by anonymous user: 108.7.160.101

Submitted values are:

Your Name: Jimmy Tobias

Mailing Address: 411A Highland Avenue MR92654

City: Somerville

State or Country: MA

Zip or Postal Code: 02144

Address Type: Business

Daytime Phone Number: 6172991832

Fax Number:

E-mail Address: 92654-57606905@requests.muckrock.com

Confirm E-mail Address : 92654-57606905@requests.muckrock.com

Your Organization:

Are you filing the request on behalf of another party? Yes

If so, who are you filing the request on behalf of? Jimmy Tobias

Contact Information Certification: I certify that the above statement(s) concerning who I am filing the request on behalf of are true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief. If I want to receive greater access to records about a person I represent, I will submit proof that the person consents to the release of the records to me, as discussed in 43 C.F.R. § 2.9.

Bureau/Office: Office of the Solicitor (SOL)

Relevant park, refuge, site or other location:

Request Description:

To Whom It May Concern:

Pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act, I hereby request the following records:

Any emails, email attachments, or other documents related to the Solicitor's review of the white paper referenced in the email chain attached below to this request. This request specifically seeks a copy of the Solicitor office's review of the white paper in question, which is entitled "The Proper Scope of Environmental Analysis of Roadway Impacts" and was written in February 2017 by lawyers for the East Collier Property Owners. This request seeks a copy of any communications between the Solicitor's office and/or the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service and the East Collier Property Owners and their lawyers at the firm Hunton & Williams/Hunton AK concerning this white paper or SOL's review of said white paper

I am a reporter with The Guardian newspaper and other outlets and ask that this request be expedited.

The requested documents will be made available to the general public, and this request is not being made for commercial purposes.

In the event that there are fees, I would be grateful if you would inform me of the total charges in advance of fulfilling my request. I would prefer the request filled electronically, by e-mail attachment if available or CD-ROM if not.

Thank you in advance for your anticipated cooperation in this matter. I look forward to receiving your response to this request within 20 business days, as the statute requires.

Sincerely,

Jimmy Tobias

Attachments:

[https://cdn.muckrock.com/outbound\\_composer\\_attachments/jtoby87%40gmail.com/83247/Screen20Shot202020-04-2820at202.43.0220PM.png](https://cdn.muckrock.com/outbound_composer_attachments/jtoby87%40gmail.com/83247/Screen20Shot202020-04-2820at202.43.0220PM.png)

Upload documents directly: [https://https://www.muckrock.comhttps://accounts.muckrock.com/accounts/login/?next=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.muckrock.com%2Faccounts%2Flogin%2F%3Fnext%3D%252Faccounts%252Fagency\\_login%252Fdepartment-of-interior-office-of-the-solicitor-2660%252Fsol-review-hunton-white-paper-department-of-interior-office-of-the-solicitor-92654%252F%253Femail%253Dsol.foia%252540sol.doi.gov&url\\_auth\\_token=AAAj\\_UoJajUjgqaqe5am6WuFo-5A%3A1jWOT6%3AGQOQb7KCD09wZrpGAZAop1qoxAY](https://https://www.muckrock.comhttps://accounts.muckrock.com/accounts/login/?next=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.muckrock.com%2Faccounts%2Flogin%2F%3Fnext%3D%252Faccounts%252Fagency_login%252Fdepartment-of-interior-office-of-the-solicitor-2660%252Fsol-review-hunton-white-paper-department-of-interior-office-of-the-solicitor-92654%252F%253Femail%253Dsol.foia%252540sol.doi.gov&url_auth_token=AAAj_UoJajUjgqaqe5am6WuFo-5A%3A1jWOT6%3AGQOQb7KCD09wZrpGAZAop1qoxAY)

Requester's Communication Preferences: Electronic communication via email

Document Disclosure Preferences: Electronic copies via email

Select the applicable reason why you are requesting expedited processing: There is an imminent threat to the life or physical safety of an individual.

Justification for Expedited Processing:

Expedited Processing Certification: I certify that the above statement(s) concerning expedited processing are true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief.

Please select the appropriate statement: I agree to pay fees up to a particular amount (see my response below).

I agree to pay fees up to this particular amount: 25.00

To assist in determining my requester category to assess fees, you should know that I am: a representative of the news media and this request is made as part of a news gathering effort and not for commercial use

Affiliated Organization:

Please explain why your request for a waiver of fees or a reduction in fees is justified.:

The results of this submission may be viewed at:

<https://www.doi.gov/node/32906/submission/607024>

**FOIA CONTROL FORM FOR**

**CONTACT**

If you have any questions, please contact us at [sol.foia.internal@sol.doi.gov](mailto:sol.foia.internal@sol.doi.gov) or 202-219-3493.

**PROCESSING PRIORITY**

The attached email will tell you what "Processing Track" this request is in. The order of priority is: Expedited, Simple, Normal, Complex, and Exceptional/Voluminous. So, for example, you should generally complete the search for all the requests you have in the Normal track, from oldest to newest, before completing your search for any requests in the Complex track.

**PLEASE COMPLETE THIS FORM IN FULL**

This information will help us timely and accurately process the FOIA request. Filling out this form completely will also help avoid further work on your part if the requester administratively appeals or litigates our response.

**CERTIFICATION**

I have undertaken a good-faith search for records potentially responsive to this request and all responsive records have been provided to SOL FOIA.

**Electronic Signature:**

\_\_\_\_\_

**DETAILS ON SEARCH**

Did you find responsive records? YES NO

Searcher name: \_\_\_\_\_

Search on behalf of (person/office): \_\_\_\_\_

Did you do a manual search for hard copy records? YES NO

Did you do an electronic search for records? YES NO

Did you do an email search? YES NO

Date search began? \_\_\_\_\_

If so, what terms did you use, or provide the search string. \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

**TOTAL SEARCH TIME AND COSTS**

Please indicate time searched rounded to the nearest 15 minutes

\_\_\_\_\_

Please indicate time reviewed rounded to the nearest 15 minutes

\_\_\_\_\_

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

*Please check all that apply*

Requested records are not located here, look within this SOL subpart or with this/these person(s) ( \_\_\_\_\_ ) instead

All responsive records should be released; in full in part withheld

Request is unclear in scope (contact the SOL FOIA team ASAP at [sol.foia.internal@sol.doi.gov](mailto:sol.foia.internal@sol.doi.gov))

Responsive records are sensitive because of existing litigation and/or important policy considerations

**From:** [Budd-Falen, Karen J](#)  
**To:** [Franklin, Micquetta V](#)  
**Subject:** Fw: Meeting to Discuss HCP Project  
**Date:** Monday, June 15, 2020 10:52:39 AM

---

FOIA SOL-2020-00147

Karen Budd-Falen  
Deputy Solicitor Fish, Wildlife and Parks  
Department of the Interior  
1849 C Street NW  
Room 6348 Washington D.C. 20240  
Telephone: 202-208-4507  
Cell: 202-365-5854

[Karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov](mailto:Karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov)

---

**From:** Skipwith, Aurelia X <[aurelia\\_x\\_skipwith@fws.gov](mailto:aurelia_x_skipwith@fws.gov)>  
**Sent:** Thursday, February 13, 2020 6:29 AM  
**To:** Turner, Andrew <[aturner@hunton.com](mailto:aturner@hunton.com)>; Budd-Falen, Karen J <[karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov](mailto:karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov)>; Romanik, Peg A <[PEG.ROMANIK@sol.doi.gov](mailto:PEG.ROMANIK@sol.doi.gov)>; Dove, William T <[william\\_dove@ios.doi.gov](mailto:william_dove@ios.doi.gov)>  
**Cc:** [cspilker@collienterprises.com](mailto:cspilker@collienterprises.com) <[cspilker@collienterprises.com](mailto:cspilker@collienterprises.com)>; Clements, E. Carter Chandler <[eclements@hunton.com](mailto:eclements@hunton.com)>  
**Subject:** RE: Meeting to Discuss HCP Project  
Good morning Andrew,  
Thank you for message and will look into this matter of the delay of the ITP being issued. Billy Dove, who I've included here, will be your point of contact. He will reach out to so that we can reach a resolution. Thank you.

---

**From:** Turner, Andrew <[aturner@hunton.com](mailto:aturner@hunton.com)>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, February 12, 2020 6:05 PM  
**To:** Skipwith, Aurelia X <[aurelia\\_x\\_skipwith@fws.gov](mailto:aurelia_x_skipwith@fws.gov)>; Budd-Falen, Karen J <[karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov](mailto:karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov)>; Romanik, Peg A <[PEG.ROMANIK@sol.doi.gov](mailto:PEG.ROMANIK@sol.doi.gov)>  
**Cc:** [cspilker@collienterprises.com](mailto:cspilker@collienterprises.com); Clements, E. Carter Chandler <[eclements@hunton.com](mailto:eclements@hunton.com)>  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Meeting to Discuss HCP Project  
Dear Director Skipwith, Deputy Solicitor Budd-Falen, and Associate Solicitor Romanik,  
On behalf of the Eastern Collier Property Owners (ECPO), I am writing to request an opportunity to discuss an issue that has delayed the review and processing of ECPO's Habitat Conservation Plan (HCP), which covers 151,442 acres of private property in Southwest Florida, and ECPO's associated incidental take permit (ITP) applications. The issue concerns whether future, offsite collisions between Florida panthers and vehicles operated by third parties on state, county and local roadways should be attributed to the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service's issuance of the proposed ITPs. The answer, in our view, is no.  
The HCP is a unique effort to achieve landscape scale conservation goals within a large area of private land owned by twelve separate companies in Southwest Florida. The HCP is the result of a collaborative effort by the landowners and four leading conservation organizations, including

Defenders of Wildlife, Florida Wildlife Federation, Audubon Florida and Audubon of the Western Everglades. The HCP is a landscape-level plan that would permanently preserve 106,442 acres of privately owned land that could otherwise be developed, to provide valuable habitat for the Florida panther and eighteen other protected species. The HCP would cap future development at 45,000 acres and cluster and direct that development to areas with lower habitat values (many of which are in active, large-scale agricultural use), and would preserve valuable regional wildlife corridors that facilitate wildlife movement between existing, publicly owned conservation lands in Southwest Florida. As an additional benefit, the HCP would establish funding mechanisms based on (i) contributions as lands are developed and (ii) fees generated as homes within the HCP Area are sold, which are projected to accrue up to \$150 million over the life of the HCP. A small portion of the funds will be used for HCP implementation, and the remainder will be available to fund other conservation activities to benefit species covered by the HCP.

The Service's issuance of the proposed ITPs is the federal agency action at issue. The ITPs would authorize take that occurs incidental to development and earth mining by ECPO members on their privately owned lands within the HCP area. The take would be in the form of harassment for the panther and most other covered species (e.g., disturbance caused by construction or mining activities), and potential harm for a few primarily ground burrowing species. The ITPs would not authorize the development or mining activities themselves. Moreover, the only roads on which collisions between panthers and vehicles are likely to occur are public roads not controlled by the applicants or covered by the HCP where vehicles travel at higher speeds. The ITPs would not apply to or govern the design or operation of those roadways, or third party vehicle operations on those roadways. Issuance of the ITPs will not determine or control whether, when or where any future panther vehicle collisions may occur. Accordingly, the Service's issuance of the ITPs is not the cause of any projected future vehicle collisions with panthers, nor are the relevant circumstances of any such future collisions reasonably certain. For this reason, future offsite third party vehicle collisions with panthers should not be deemed "effects of the action" under 50 C.F.R. 402.02.

The ECPO members have, since the time their ITP applications were first submitted in June 2010 (and resubmitted in August and September 2018), consistently taken the position that issuance of the ITPs will not be the cause of future offsite third party vehicle collisions with panthers.

Nonetheless, while such collisions should not be deemed "effects of the action" under 50 C.F.R. 402.02, the ECPO members have urged the Service to carefully analyze panther-vehicle collisions in baseline and cumulative effects analyses, and have provided substantial analytical information and technical data to support such analyses. Additionally, the ECPO members have committed to direct at least fifty percent of the first \$25 million of funding generated by HCP implementation toward the construction of wildlife crossings and associated fencing on public roadways in order to reduce vehicle collisions with panthers and other species, as sought by the Service and other stakeholders. The HCP process (including the Department's review timeline) is stalled, and has been paused since August 2019 to address this issue. Accordingly, we request and look forward to an opportunity to discuss this issue with you.

Best Regards,

Andrew J. Turner

Partner

Hunton Andrews Kurth LLP

2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20037

202.955.1658

**From:** [Budd-Falen, Karen J](#)  
**To:** [Franklin, Micquetta V](#)  
**Subject:** Fw: Meeting to Discuss HCP Project  
**Date:** Monday, June 15, 2020 10:53:13 AM

---

FOIA SOL-2020-00147

Karen Budd-Falen  
Deputy Solicitor Fish, Wildlife and Parks  
Department of the Interior  
1849 C Street NW  
Room 6348 Washington D.C. 20240  
Telephone: 202-208-4507  
Cell: 202-365-5854

[Karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov](mailto:Karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov)

---

**From:** Skipwith, Aurelia X <[aurelia\\_x\\_skipwith@fws.gov](mailto:aurelia_x_skipwith@fws.gov)>  
**Sent:** Thursday, February 13, 2020 6:29 AM  
**To:** Turner, Andrew <[aturner@hunton.com](mailto:aturner@hunton.com)>; Budd-Falen, Karen J <[karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov](mailto:karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov)>; Romanik, Peg A <[PEG.ROMANIK@sol.doi.gov](mailto:PEG.ROMANIK@sol.doi.gov)>; Dove, William T <[william\\_dove@ios.doi.gov](mailto:william_dove@ios.doi.gov)>  
**Cc:** [cspilker@collienterprises.com](mailto:cspilker@collienterprises.com) <[cspilker@collienterprises.com](mailto:cspilker@collienterprises.com)>; Clements, E. Carter Chandler <[eclements@hunton.com](mailto:eclements@hunton.com)>  
**Subject:** RE: Meeting to Discuss HCP Project  
Good morning Andrew,  
Thank you for message and will look into this matter of the delay of the ITP being issued. Billy Dove, who I've included here, will be your point of contact. He will reach out to so that we can reach a resolution. Thank you.

---

**From:** Turner, Andrew <[aturner@hunton.com](mailto:aturner@hunton.com)>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, February 12, 2020 6:05 PM  
**To:** Skipwith, Aurelia X <[aurelia\\_x\\_skipwith@fws.gov](mailto:aurelia_x_skipwith@fws.gov)>; Budd-Falen, Karen J <[karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov](mailto:karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov)>; Romanik, Peg A <[PEG.ROMANIK@sol.doi.gov](mailto:PEG.ROMANIK@sol.doi.gov)>  
**Cc:** [cspilker@collienterprises.com](mailto:cspilker@collienterprises.com); Clements, E. Carter Chandler <[eclements@hunton.com](mailto:eclements@hunton.com)>  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Meeting to Discuss HCP Project  
Dear Director Skipwith, Deputy Solicitor Budd-Falen, and Associate Solicitor Romanik,  
On behalf of the Eastern Collier Property Owners (ECPO), I am writing to request an opportunity to discuss an issue that has delayed the review and processing of ECPO's Habitat Conservation Plan (HCP), which covers 151,442 acres of private property in Southwest Florida, and ECPO's associated incidental take permit (ITP) applications. The issue concerns whether future, offsite collisions between Florida panthers and vehicles operated by third parties on state, county and local roadways should be attributed to the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service's issuance of the proposed ITPs. The answer, in our view, is no.  
The HCP is a unique effort to achieve landscape scale conservation goals within a large area of private land owned by twelve separate companies in Southwest Florida. The HCP is the result of a collaborative effort by the landowners and four leading conservation organizations, including

Defenders of Wildlife, Florida Wildlife Federation, Audubon Florida and Audubon of the Western Everglades. The HCP is a landscape-level plan that would permanently preserve 106,442 acres of privately owned land that could otherwise be developed, to provide valuable habitat for the Florida panther and eighteen other protected species. The HCP would cap future development at 45,000 acres and cluster and direct that development to areas with lower habitat values (many of which are in active, large-scale agricultural use), and would preserve valuable regional wildlife corridors that facilitate wildlife movement between existing, publicly owned conservation lands in Southwest Florida. As an additional benefit, the HCP would establish funding mechanisms based on (i) contributions as lands are developed and (ii) fees generated as homes within the HCP Area are sold, which are projected to accrue up to \$150 million over the life of the HCP. A small portion of the funds will be used for HCP implementation, and the remainder will be available to fund other conservation activities to benefit species covered by the HCP.

The Service's issuance of the proposed ITPs is the federal agency action at issue. The ITPs would authorize take that occurs incidental to development and earth mining by ECPO members on their privately owned lands within the HCP area. The take would be in the form of harassment for the panther and most other covered species (e.g., disturbance caused by construction or mining activities), and potential harm for a few primarily ground burrowing species. The ITPs would not authorize the development or mining activities themselves. Moreover, the only roads on which collisions between panthers and vehicles are likely to occur are public roads not controlled by the applicants or covered by the HCP where vehicles travel at higher speeds. The ITPs would not apply to or govern the design or operation of those roadways, or third party vehicle operations on those roadways. Issuance of the ITPs will not determine or control whether, when or where any future panther vehicle collisions may occur. Accordingly, the Service's issuance of the ITPs is not the cause of any projected future vehicle collisions with panthers, nor are the relevant circumstances of any such future collisions reasonably certain. For this reason, future offsite third party vehicle collisions with panthers should not be deemed "effects of the action" under 50 C.F.R. 402.02.

The ECPO members have, since the time their ITP applications were first submitted in June 2010 (and resubmitted in August and September 2018), consistently taken the position that issuance of the ITPs will not be the cause of future offsite third party vehicle collisions with panthers.

Nonetheless, while such collisions should not be deemed "effects of the action" under 50 C.F.R. 402.02, the ECPO members have urged the Service to carefully analyze panther-vehicle collisions in baseline and cumulative effects analyses, and have provided substantial analytical information and technical data to support such analyses. Additionally, the ECPO members have committed to direct at least fifty percent of the first \$25 million of funding generated by HCP implementation toward the construction of wildlife crossings and associated fencing on public roadways in order to reduce vehicle collisions with panthers and other species, as sought by the Service and other stakeholders. The HCP process (including the Department's review timeline) is stalled, and has been paused since August 2019 to address this issue. Accordingly, we request and look forward to an opportunity to discuss this issue with you.

Best Regards,

Andrew J. Turner

Partner

Hunton Andrews Kurth LLP

2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20037

202.955.1658

**From:** [Budd-Falen, Karen J](#)  
**To:** [Franklin, Micquetta V](#)  
**Subject:** Fw: Meeting to Discuss HCP Project  
**Date:** Monday, June 15, 2020 10:53:36 AM

---

FOIA SOL-2020-00147

Karen Budd-Falen  
Deputy Solicitor Fish, Wildlife and Parks  
Department of the Interior  
1849 C Street NW  
Room 6348 Washington D.C. 20240  
Telephone: 202-208-4507  
Cell: 202-365-5854

[Karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov](mailto:Karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov)

---

**From:** Turner, Andrew <aturner@hunton.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, February 12, 2020 6:04 PM  
**To:** Skipwith, Aurelia X <aurelia\_x\_skipwith@fws.gov>; Budd-Falen, Karen J <karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov>; Romanik, Peg A <PEG.ROMANIK@sol.doi.gov>  
**Cc:** cspilker@collienterprises.com <cspilker@collienterprises.com>; Clements, E. Carter Chandler <eclements@hunton.com>  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Meeting to Discuss HCP Project

Dear Director Skipwith, Deputy Solicitor Budd-Falen, and Associate Solicitor Romanik,  
On behalf of the Eastern Collier Property Owners (ECPO), I am writing to request an opportunity to discuss an issue that has delayed the review and processing of ECPO's Habitat Conservation Plan (HCP), which covers 151,442 acres of private property in Southwest Florida, and ECPO's associated incidental take permit (ITP) applications. The issue concerns whether future, offsite collisions between Florida panthers and vehicles operated by third parties on state, county and local roadways should be attributed to the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service's issuance of the proposed ITPs. The answer, in our view, is no.

The HCP is a unique effort to achieve landscape scale conservation goals within a large area of private land owned by twelve separate companies in Southwest Florida. The HCP is the result of a collaborative effort by the landowners and four leading conservation organizations, including Defenders of Wildlife, Florida Wildlife Federation, Audubon Florida and Audubon of the Western Everglades. The HCP is a landscape-level plan that would permanently preserve 106,442 acres of privately owned land that could otherwise be developed, to provide valuable habitat for the Florida panther and eighteen other protected species. The HCP would cap future development at 45,000 acres and cluster and direct that development to areas with lower habitat values (many of which are in active, large-scale agricultural use), and would preserve valuable regional wildlife corridors that facilitate wildlife movement between existing, publicly owned conservation lands in Southwest Florida. As an additional benefit, the HCP would establish funding mechanisms based on (i) contributions as lands are developed and (ii) fees generated as homes within the HCP Area are sold, which are projected to accrue up to \$150 million over the life of the HCP. A small portion of the

funds will be used for HCP implementation, and the remainder will be available to fund other conservation activities to benefit species covered by the HCP.

The Service's issuance of the proposed ITPs is the federal agency action at issue. The ITPs would authorize take that occurs incidental to development and earth mining by ECPO members on their privately owned lands within the HCP area. The take would be in the form of harassment for the panther and most other covered species (e.g., disturbance caused by construction or mining activities), and potential harm for a few primarily ground burrowing species. The ITPs would not authorize the development or mining activities themselves. Moreover, the only roads on which collisions between panthers and vehicles are likely to occur are public roads not controlled by the applicants or covered by the HCP where vehicles travel at higher speeds. The ITPs would not apply to or govern the design or operation of those roadways, or third party vehicle operations on those roadways. Issuance of the ITPs will not determine or control whether, when or where any future panther vehicle collisions may occur. Accordingly, the Service's issuance of the ITPs is not the cause of any projected future vehicle collisions with panthers, nor are the relevant circumstances of any such future collisions reasonably certain. For this reason, future offsite third party vehicle collisions with panthers should not be deemed "effects of the action" under 50 C.F.R. 402.02.

The ECPO members have, since the time their ITP applications were first submitted in June 2010 (and resubmitted in August and September 2018), consistently taken the position that issuance of the ITPs will not be the cause of future offsite third party vehicle collisions with panthers.

Nonetheless, while such collisions should not be deemed "effects of the action" under 50 C.F.R. 402.02, the ECPO members have urged the Service to carefully analyze panther-vehicle collisions in baseline and cumulative effects analyses, and have provided substantial analytical information and technical data to support such analyses. Additionally, the ECPO members have committed to direct at least fifty percent of the first \$25 million of funding generated by HCP implementation toward the construction of wildlife crossings and associated fencing on public roadways in order to reduce vehicle collisions with panthers and other species, as sought by the Service and other stakeholders. The HCP process (including the Department's review timeline) is stalled, and has been paused since August 2019 to address this issue. Accordingly, we request and look forward to an opportunity to discuss this issue with you.

Best Regards,

Andrew J. Turner

Partner

Hunton Andrews Kurth LLP

2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20037

202.955.1658

**From:** [Budd-Falen, Karen J](#)  
**To:** [Franklin, Micquetta V](#)  
**Subject:** Fw: Meeting to Discuss HCP Project  
**Date:** Monday, June 15, 2020 10:53:58 AM

---

FOIA SOL-2020-00147

Karen Budd-Falen  
Deputy Solicitor Fish, Wildlife and Parks  
Department of the Interior  
1849 C Street NW  
Room 6348 Washington D.C. 20240  
Telephone: 202-208-4507  
Cell: 202-365-5854

[Karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov](mailto:Karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov)

---

**From:** Turner, Andrew <aturner@hunton.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, February 12, 2020 6:04 PM  
**To:** Skipwith, Aurelia X <aurelia\_x\_skipwith@fws.gov>; Budd-Falen, Karen J <karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov>; Romanik, Peg A <PEG.ROMANIK@sol.doi.gov>  
**Cc:** cspilker@collienterprises.com <cspilker@collienterprises.com>; Clements, E. Carter Chandler <eclements@hunton.com>  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Meeting to Discuss HCP Project

Dear Director Skipwith, Deputy Solicitor Budd-Falen, and Associate Solicitor Romanik,  
On behalf of the Eastern Collier Property Owners (ECPO), I am writing to request an opportunity to discuss an issue that has delayed the review and processing of ECPO's Habitat Conservation Plan (HCP), which covers 151,442 acres of private property in Southwest Florida, and ECPO's associated incidental take permit (ITP) applications. The issue concerns whether future, offsite collisions between Florida panthers and vehicles operated by third parties on state, county and local roadways should be attributed to the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service's issuance of the proposed ITPs. The answer, in our view, is no.

The HCP is a unique effort to achieve landscape scale conservation goals within a large area of private land owned by twelve separate companies in Southwest Florida. The HCP is the result of a collaborative effort by the landowners and four leading conservation organizations, including Defenders of Wildlife, Florida Wildlife Federation, Audubon Florida and Audubon of the Western Everglades. The HCP is a landscape-level plan that would permanently preserve 106,442 acres of privately owned land that could otherwise be developed, to provide valuable habitat for the Florida panther and eighteen other protected species. The HCP would cap future development at 45,000 acres and cluster and direct that development to areas with lower habitat values (many of which are in active, large-scale agricultural use), and would preserve valuable regional wildlife corridors that facilitate wildlife movement between existing, publicly owned conservation lands in Southwest Florida. As an additional benefit, the HCP would establish funding mechanisms based on (i) contributions as lands are developed and (ii) fees generated as homes within the HCP Area are sold, which are projected to accrue up to \$150 million over the life of the HCP. A small portion of the

funds will be used for HCP implementation, and the remainder will be available to fund other conservation activities to benefit species covered by the HCP.

The Service's issuance of the proposed ITPs is the federal agency action at issue. The ITPs would authorize take that occurs incidental to development and earth mining by ECPO members on their privately owned lands within the HCP area. The take would be in the form of harassment for the panther and most other covered species (e.g., disturbance caused by construction or mining activities), and potential harm for a few primarily ground burrowing species. The ITPs would not authorize the development or mining activities themselves. Moreover, the only roads on which collisions between panthers and vehicles are likely to occur are public roads not controlled by the applicants or covered by the HCP where vehicles travel at higher speeds. The ITPs would not apply to or govern the design or operation of those roadways, or third party vehicle operations on those roadways. Issuance of the ITPs will not determine or control whether, when or where any future panther vehicle collisions may occur. Accordingly, the Service's issuance of the ITPs is not the cause of any projected future vehicle collisions with panthers, nor are the relevant circumstances of any such future collisions reasonably certain. For this reason, future offsite third party vehicle collisions with panthers should not be deemed "effects of the action" under 50 C.F.R. 402.02.

The ECPO members have, since the time their ITP applications were first submitted in June 2010 (and resubmitted in August and September 2018), consistently taken the position that issuance of the ITPs will not be the cause of future offsite third party vehicle collisions with panthers.

Nonetheless, while such collisions should not be deemed "effects of the action" under 50 C.F.R. 402.02, the ECPO members have urged the Service to carefully analyze panther-vehicle collisions in baseline and cumulative effects analyses, and have provided substantial analytical information and technical data to support such analyses. Additionally, the ECPO members have committed to direct at least fifty percent of the first \$25 million of funding generated by HCP implementation toward the construction of wildlife crossings and associated fencing on public roadways in order to reduce vehicle collisions with panthers and other species, as sought by the Service and other stakeholders. The HCP process (including the Department's review timeline) is stalled, and has been paused since August 2019 to address this issue. Accordingly, we request and look forward to an opportunity to discuss this issue with you.

Best Regards,

Andrew J. Turner

Partner

Hunton Andrews Kurth LLP

2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20037

202.955.1658

**From:** [Franklin, MicQuetta V](#)  
**To:** [Budd-Falen, Karen J](#)  
**Subject:** New FOIA Request For SOL-2020-00171  
**Date:** Monday, July 6, 2020 2:47:13 PM  
**Attachments:** [FOIA Request SOL-2020-00171 \(Tobias\).pdf](#)  
[FOIA Control Form \(10.8.19\).pdf](#)

---

Good afternoon Karen,

The SOL FOIA Office received a request on, June 22, 2020 (attached) in which the requester, Mr. Jimmy Tobias seeks

“Any and all written or electronic communications, including email attachments, sent or received by Karen Budd-Falen that contain one or more of the following words or phrases: "ECPO", "ECMSHCP", "Collier", "Colliers", "Spilker", "Hunton", and/or "panther". This request seeks records produced since October 1, 2018.”

Please provide your response to this email, affirming or denying whether you believe you will have responsive information within one business day of receipt. Additionally, **please provide the date when you started your search for responsive documents.**

**Please let me know if you have any concerns about the scope as soon as possible.**

**Attached is a Control Form please send the form back completed with your responsive documents.**

Please provide any responsive documents by **Monday, July 13th**

Thank you.

**MicQuetta Franklin**  
Litigation Support II  
Division of Administration  
Office of the Solicitor  
U.S. Department of the Interior  
1849 C St., NW MS 6071  
Washington, DC 20240  
**Office (202) 219-3493**

The following list contains the entire submission submitted June 24, 2020 11:10:03pm ET, and is formatted for ease of viewing and printing.

---

## Contact information

<b>First name</b>	Jimmy
<b>Last name</b>	Tobias
<b>Mailing Address</b>	MuckRock News DEPT MR 95549 411A Highland Ave
<b>City</b>	Somerville
<b>State/Province</b>	MA
<b>Postal Code</b>	02144
<b>Country</b>	United States
<b>Phone</b>	6172991832
<b>Email</b>	95549-60428984@requests.muckrock.com

---

## Request

<b>Request ID</b>	139131
<b>Confirmation ID</b>	138606

<b>Request description</b>	<p>To Whom It May Concern: Pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act, I hereby request the following records: Any and all written or electronic communications , including email attachments, sent or received by Karen Budd-Falen that contain one or more of the following words or phrases: "ECPO", "ECMSHCP", "Collier", "Colliers", "Spilker", "Hunton", and/or "panther". This request seeks records produced since October 1, 2018. I am a reporter with The Guardian. The requested documents will be made available to the general public, and this request is not being made for commercial purposes. In the event that there are fees, I would be grateful if you would inform me of the total charges in advance of fulfilling my request. I would prefer the request filled electronically, by e-mail attachment if available or CD-ROM if not. Thank you in advance for your anticipated cooperation in this matter. I look forward to receiving your response to this request within 20 business days, as the statute requires. Sincerely, Jimmy Tobias</p>
----------------------------	---

---

## Supporting documentation

---

## Fees

<b>Request category ID</b>	media
----------------------------	-------

**Fee waiver**

yes

**Explanation**

News media

---

**Expedited processing**

**Expedited Processing**

no

**From:** [Franklin, Micquetta V](#)  
**To:** [Budd-Falen, Karen J](#)  
**Subject:** Re: New FOIA Request For SOL-2020-00171  
**Date:** Friday, July 24, 2020 11:23:55 AM

---

Good morning karen,

On July 6, 2020 FOIA request number SOL-2020-00171 was sent to you for review and response. To date, I have not received your response indicating that you have no responsive information, or your responsive information. In order to follow the guidelines established by the FOIA and avoid any potential litigation, please send your full response by (day 15). If you would like any assistance in gathering your responsive information, please let me know as soon as possible.

Thank you.

MicQuetta

---

**From:** Franklin, Micquetta V  
**Sent:** Monday, July 6, 2020 2:46 PM  
**To:** Budd-Falen, Karen J <karen.budd-falen@sol.doi.gov>  
**Subject:** New FOIA Request For SOL-2020-00171

Good afternoon Karen,

The SOL FOIA Office received a request on, June 22, 2020 (attached) in which the requester, Mr. Jimmy Tobias seeks

“Any and all written or electronic communications, including email attachments, sent or received by Karen Budd-Falen that contain one or more of the following words or phrases: "ECPO", "ECMSHCP", "Collier", "Colliers", "Spilker", "Hunton", and/or "panther". This request seeks records produced since October 1, 2018.”

Please provide your response to this email, affirming or denying whether you believe you will have responsive information within one business day of receipt. Additionally, **please provide the date when you started your search for responsive documents.**

**Please let me know if you have any concerns about the scope as soon as possible.**

**Attached is a Control Form please send the form back completed with your responsive documents.**

Please provide any responsive documents by **Monday, July 13th**

Thank you.

**MicQuetta Franklin**

Litigation Support II  
Division of Administration  
Office of the Solicitor  
U.S. Department of the Interior  
1849 C St., NW MS 6071  
Washington, DC 20240  
Office (202) 219-3493